



UNIVERSITÀ

**LUM**

GIUSEPPE  
DEGENNARO

International Doctorate in Economics and Management of Sustainability and Innovation  
XXXVII Cycle

**FINAL REPORT OF THE EXAMINING BOARD FOR THE ADMISSION  
COMPETITION TO THE INTERNATIONAL RESEARCH DOCTORATE IN  
“ECONOMICS AND MANAGEMENT OF SUSTAINABILITY AND INNOVATION”  
- XXXVII CYCLE – ACADEMIC YEAR 2021-2022 - ADDITIONAL ADMISSION D.M.  
1061/21**

The members of the Examining Board are appointed by President's Decree D.P. N. 249/21 in the persons of:

Prof. Angeloantonio Russo, Prof. Filippo Vitolla, Prof. Giustina Secundo, Prof. Domenico Morrone and Dr. Riccardo De Blasis. Dr. Riccardo De Blasis is connected remotely via Google Meet platform at <https://meet.google.com/hyr-dmrv-utx>.

The Examining Board appoints in the first meeting Prof. Angeloantonio Russo as President. Dr. Riccardo De Blasis is appointed recording secretary of the meeting. The Examining Board meets at 1.20pm, December 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2021, in order to produce the final report.

**MEETING no. 1**

On November 19<sup>th</sup>, 2021, at 9.00 am, after having duly called the meeting on November 16<sup>th</sup>, 2021, the assembly of the Examining board committee for the additional admission competition to the international research doctorate in “Economics and Management of Sustainability and Innovation” - XXXVII cycle – academic year 2021-2022 takes place on computer-base.

Therefore, in attendance:

Prof. Angeloantonio Russo, Prof. Filippo Vitolla, Prof. Giustina Secundo, Prof. Domenico Morrone and Dr. Riccardo De Blasis. The Examining board appoints Prof. Angeloantonio Russo as Chairman. Dr. Riccardo De Blasis is appointed recording Secretary of the meeting.

Then the Examining Board Committee reads the announcement and sets the following criteria in order to evaluate the qualifications and research projects submitted by the candidates. Based on



UNIVERSITÀ

**LUM**

GIUSEPPE  
DEGENNARO

International Doctorate in Economics and Management of Sustainability and Innovation  
XXXVII Cycle

the declaration in article 6 of the call for applications, the Examining Board sets the following detailed evaluation criteria, with specific regard to the assessment of curriculum vitae, qualifications, reference letters and research projects submitted by the candidates, as follows:

- Curriculum vitae and other qualifications (publications, degree awards, master on the subject of this PhD, etc.) and reference letters: a maximum of 20/100 points;
- Research projects: within the maximum score of 50/100 points for the research project set by the call for application, the Examining Board assesses the following aspects:
  - Clarity and research attitude: are the objectives of the proposed project clearly explained? Is the project consistent with the green or innovation issues? Are the research questions consistent with the method? Is the proposed timeline consistent with the objectives? Does the research project address both theoretical and empirical issues? Are they consistent? Is the expected theoretical contribution clearly outlined? Are the research methods suitably described?
  - Fit with the PhD program: the Examining Board assesses whether the research project fits well with the main topic related to the PhD program in Economics and Management of Sustainability and Innovation.

In order to carry out the above-mentioned evaluations the Examining Board will use, if possible, parameters recognized in the international scientific field.

The Chairman recalls to the other members of the Examining Board that the admission exam will consist of the evaluation of the qualifications and research projects, and of an oral exam.

Then, the Examining Board, according to art. 6 of the announcement, reaffirms as follows:

- In order to be admitted to the PhD Course the candidate must have a maximum score of 100/100 and a minimum score of 50/100.
- A sufficient evaluation by the Examining Board is synthesized as follows:
  - a) The maximum score for the qualifications and for the other documents submitted to the Examining Board's evaluation is 20/100.
  - b) The maximum score for the research project is 50/100.



UNIVERSITÀ

**LUM**

GIUSEPPE  
DEGENNARO

International Doctorate in Economics and Management of Sustainability and Innovation  
XXXVII Cycle

c) The maximum score for the oral exam is 30/100.

The Examining Board set the cut-off level to be admitted to the oral exam in a minimum score of 35/100, as an average minimum score for the above points a) and b).

Last, the Examining board declares that there are no parental relationships, within the fourth degree among the members of the Examining Board. Moreover, they declare that there are no situations of incompatibility among them according to art. 51 and 52 of the civil procedure code.

As last fulfillment, the Examining Board sets the oral exam on December 2nd, 2021 with the following specifications as by the call for applications:

- An oral exam will take place at LUM University.
- An oral exam for candidates, who have submitted specific requests as in the call for applications, that is no later than the deadline of the call for application (art. 5), will take place through online systems. Those candidates, if admitted to the oral exam, have to **send an email to Mariateresa Santaloia ([santaloia@lum.it](mailto:santaloia@lum.it)) no later than November 26<sup>th</sup>, 2021** in order to confirm their availability to attend the oral exam.

**The Minutes 1 and the results of the evaluation of the qualifications and research projects for each candidate will be affixed on the door of the PhD Administrative Staff at the Rettorato building and published on LUM web site.**

At 09.15 am the Examining Board declares the meeting closed and calls a further meeting on November 19<sup>th</sup>, 09.20 am to proceed with the assessment of qualifications and research projects. These Minutes are written, read and approved immediately. The Chairman signed immediately these Minutes. Signed letters of attendance by the other members of the Examining Board are attached to these Minutes.

## MEETING no. 2



U N I V E R S I T À

**LUM**

GIUSEPPE  
DEGENNARO

International Doctorate in Economics and Management of Sustainability and Innovation  
XXXVII Cycle

On November 19<sup>th</sup>, 2021, at 09.20 am, after having duly called the meeting, the assembly of the Examining board committee for the additional admission competition to the international research doctorate in “Economics and Management of Sustainability and Innovation” - XXXVII cycle – academic year 2021-2022 takes place on computer-base.

In attendance:

Prof. Angeloantonio Russo, Prof. Filippo Vitolla, Prof. Giustina Secundo, Prof. Domenico Morrone and Dr. Riccardo De Blasis. The Examining board appoints Prof. Angeloantonio Russo as Chairman. Dr. De Blasis is appointed recording Secretary of the meeting.

Having defined the criteria for the evaluation of the qualifications and research projects (Minutes 1) submitted by the candidates, the Examining Board members share the received documents by each candidate through a Google Drive folder named PhD LUM XXXVII Cycle PON MUR. Examining the list of the candidates each member of the Examining board declares that there are no parental relationships within the fourth degree among them and each candidate. They declare even that there are no situations of incompatibility among them and the candidates according with art. 51 and 52 of the civil procedure code.

The candidates who have regularly responded to the call for applications, and admitted to the assessment of qualifications and projects, are:

**Table 1. Candidates admitted to the assessment of qualifications and research projects**

Last Name	First Name
Barone	Ilaria
Di Laura	Danilo
El Assal	Saida
Frascati	Domenico
Marino	Marta Rosaria
Palmisano	Alessia
Pinto	Monica
Sallaku	Karolina



UNIVERSITÀ

**LUM**

GIUSEPPE  
DEGENNARO

International Doctorate in Economics and Management of Sustainability and Innovation  
XXXVII Cycle

Suleiman	Nabil
Zia	Sufyan

The administrative office informed the Examining Board that candidate Ahmed Farooq did not send the admission payment. Therefore, he is excluded from the assessment.

The Examining Board, based on the assessment of the qualifications and research projects submitted by the candidates, having formalized the detailed criteria for the evaluation of qualifications and research projects (Minutes 1), provides the following rankings with candidates admitted to the oral exam:

**Table 2. Evaluation of qualifications and research projects for 2 scholarships for green issues**

N.	Last Name	First Name	Total qualifications (20/100)	Project (50/100)	Total
1	Barone	Ilaria	14	30	44
2	Frascati	Domenico	11	40	51
3	Suleiman	Nabil	14	25	39

**Table 3. Evaluation of qualifications and research projects for 2 scholarships for innovation issues**

N.	Last Name	First Name	Total qualifications (20/100)	Project (50/100)	Total
1	Di Laura	Danilo	15	20	35



UNIVERSITÀ

**LUM**GIUSEPPE  
DEGENNAROInternational Doctorate in Economics and Management of Sustainability and Innovation  
XXXVII Cycle

2	El Assal	Saida	11	40	51
3	Marino	Marta Rosaria	7	20	Not admitted
4	Palmisano	Alessia	9	35	44
5	Pinto	Monica	12	25	37
6	Sullaku	Karolina	12	40	52
7	Zia	Sufyan	8	30	38

Finally, the Examining Board declares that candidates admitted to the oral exam, which will be held on December 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2021, are summoned as the following schedule:

**Table 4: Scheduling for the oral exam**

N.	Last Name	First Name	Qualifications and research project	Calendar
1	Barone	Ilaria	44	9.00am, LUM University
2	Di Laura	Danilo	35	9.00am, LUM University
3	El Assal	Saida	51	9.00am, LUM University
4	Frascati	Domenico	51	9.00am, LUM University
5	Palmisano	Alessia	44	9.00am, LUM University
6	Pinto	Monica	37	9.00am, LUM University
7	Suleiman	Nabil	39	9.00am, LUM University
8	Sullaku	Karolina	52	9.00am, LUM University
9	Zia	Sufyan	38	9.00am, LUM University

Non-Italian candidates who have regularly submitted requests to attend the oral exam through online systems have to be ready for an online interview, based on the above calendar (if any). Those candidates, if admitted to the oral exam, have to **send an email to Mariateresa Santaloia ([santaloia@lum.it](mailto:santaloia@lum.it)) no later than November 26<sup>th</sup>, 2021** in order to confirm their availability to attend the oral exam.

The Examining Board will contact the candidates based on the above calendar. The Examining Board is not responsible for any difficulties in the online connection for the evaluation process.



UNIVERSITÀ

**LUM**

GIUSEPPE  
DEGENNARO

International Doctorate in Economics and Management of Sustainability and Innovation  
XXXVII Cycle

**The results of the evaluation of the qualifications and research projects for all the candidates will be affixed on the door of the PhD Administrative Staff at the Rettorato building and published on LUM web site.**

At 10.00am the Examining Board declares the meeting closed and calls a further meeting on December 2nd, 08.45am to proceed with the oral exam.

These Minutes are written, read and approved immediately. The Chairman signed immediately these Minutes. Signed letters of attendance by the other members of the Examining Board are already attached to Minutes no. 1.

### **MEETING no. 3**

On December 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2021, at 9.00am, the assembly of the Examining Board committee for the additional admission to the international research doctorate in “Economics and Management of Sustainability and Innovation” - XXXVII cycle – academic year 2021-2022 takes place in the Rectorate building of LUM University to evaluate the oral exam of the candidates. In attendance: Prof. Angeloantonio Russo, Prof. Filippo Vitolla, Prof. Giustina Secundo, Prof. Domenico Morrone, and Dr. Riccardo De Blasis. Dr. Riccardo De Blasis is connected remotely via Google Meet platform at <https://meet.google.com/yqi-xkwv-rxv>. The Examining board appoints Prof. Angeloantonio Russo as Chairman. Dr. Riccardo De Blasis is appointed as recording Secretary of the meeting.

The Chairman recalls that the Examining board has 30/100 points for assessing the oral exam of the candidates.

Based on the certifications received from the Administrative Office, the scheduling communicated to the candidates and the requests from candidates Sufyan Zia and Nabil Suleiman to attend the oral exam in distance, the Examining board certifies the online presence of the candidates as follow:



UNIVERSITÀ

**LUM**GIUSEPPE  
DEGENNAROInternational Doctorate in Economics and Management of Sustainability and Innovation  
XXXVII Cycle**Table 1. Attendance at the oral exam: candidates allowed to attend the oral exam in distance**

nr.	Last name	Given Name	Calendar	Presence
1	Suleiman	Nabil	9.00am Google Meet: <a href="https://meet.google.com/vqi-xkwv-rxv">https://meet.google.com/vqi-xkwv-rxv</a>	Present
2	Zia	Sufyan	9.00am Google Meet: <a href="https://meet.google.com/vqi-xkwv-rxv">https://meet.google.com/vqi-xkwv-rxv</a>	Present

Therefore, the Examining Commission invites the first candidate, and the oral exam starts officially at 9.25am. After having listened to the last candidate, the Examining Board proceeds with the oral exam for the other candidates, based on the certifications received from the Administrative Office, and the scheduling communicated to the candidates. The Examining Board, therefore, certifies the presence of the candidates as follow:

**Table 2. Attendance at the oral exam: candidates present at LUM University**

nr.	Last name	Given Name	Calendar	Presence
1	Barone	Ilaria	09.00am, LUM University	Present
2	Di Laura	Danilo	09.00am, LUM University	Absent
3	El Assal	Saida	09.00am, LUM University	Present
4	Frascati	Domenico	09.00am, LUM University	Present
5	Palmisano	Alessia	09.00am, LUM University	Absent
6	Pinto	Monica	09.00am, LUM University	Absent
7	Sallaku	Karolina	09.00am, LUM University	Present

The Examining Board notes the correct name of the candidate Sallaku Karolina who was wrongly spelled as Sullaku Karolina in previous minutes and notices. After having listened to the last candidate, the Examining Board stops for a break at 11.15am.

After the break, the Examining Board resumes at 12.30am and proceeds with the overall assessment of the candidates on a comparative basis in a separate Google Meet room <https://meet.google.com/hyr-dmrv-utx>. Having assessed the candidates, the Examining Board transmits the merit-based ranking in order to be published by President's Decree as follows:





UNIVERSITÀ

**LUM**GIUSEPPE  
DEGENNAROInternational Doctorate in Economics and Management of Sustainability and Innovation  
XXXVII Cycle**Table 3. Oral exam and final ranking for 2 scholarships for green issues**

nr.	Candidate	Total qualifications (20/100)	Project (50/100)	Oral (30/100)	Final
1	Barone Ilaria	14	30	25	69
2	Frascati Domenico	11	40	30	81
3	Suleiman Nabil	14	25	25	64

**Table 4. Oral exam and final ranking for 2 scholarships for innovation issues**

nr.	Candidate	Total qualifications (20/100)	Project (50/100)	Oral (30/100)	Final
1	El Assal Saida	11	40	28	79
2	Sallaku Karolina	12	40	30	82
3	Zia Sufyan	8	30	28	66

The minutes, duly signed on every page by the President and by other members of the Examining Board, are transferred to the Administrative Office of the Università LUM Giuseppe Degennaro, for further actions. Tables 3 and 4 (Annex 1 to these Minutes 3) will be published on the LUM website and will be affixed to the door of the PhD Administrative Staff.

At 1.15pm the President declares the meeting closed and calls a further meeting on December 2<sup>nd</sup>, 1.20pm to proceed with the final Minutes.

This final report is written, read, and approved immediately.

At 1.50pm the President declares the meeting closed.

This final report is written, read, and approved immediately.

Casamassima, December 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2021



UNIVERSITÀ

**LUM**

GIUSEPPE  
DEGENNARO

International Doctorate in Economics and Management of Sustainability and Innovation  
XXXVII Cycle

Prof. Angeloantonio Russo (Chairman)

Prof. Filippo Vitolla

Prof. Giustina Secundo

Prof. Domenico Morrone

Dr. Riccardo De Blasis (Secretary)



UNIVERSITÀ

**LUM**

GIUSEPPE  
DEGENNARO

International Doctorate in Economics and Management of Sustainability and Innovation  
XXXVII Cycle

## ANNEX 1 to MINUTES 3.

### Results of the oral exam and final score.

#### 2 scholarships related to green issues

nr.	Candidate	Total qualifications (20/100)	Project (50/100)	Oral (30/100)	Final
1	Barone Ilaria	14	30	25	69
2	Frascati Domenico	11	40	30	81
3	Suleiman Nabil	14	25	25	64

#### 2 scholarships related to innovation issues

nr.	Candidate	Total qualifications (20/100)	Project (50/100)	Oral (30/100)	Final
1	El Assal Saida	11	40	28	79
2	Sallaku Karolina	12	40	30	82
3	Zia Sufyan	8	30	28	66

Casamassima, December 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2021

Prof. Angeloantonio Russo (Chairman)

Prof. Filippo Vitolla

Prof. Giustina Secundo

Prof. Domenico Morrone

Dr. Riccardo De Blasis (Secretary)

## DECLARATION

The undersigned PROF. Riccardo De Blasis declares that on the December 2nd, 2021 from 9.00am he has attended the computer based meetings of the Examining Board for the admission process at the International research doctorate in "Economics and Management of Sustainability and Innovation" – XXXVII cycle, whose minutes are conformed to what he has discussed and/or received by mail from the other members of the Examining who have, together with the Chairman, agreed on the contents.

December 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2021

Signed Prof. 